

Submission No.			048		
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter			College and Wainsfort Residents Association		
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response	
314724: Estuary through Swords, Dublin Airport, Ballymun, Glasnevin and City Centre to Charlemont, Co. Dublin					
1	Statement	1	The College and Wainsfort Residents Association submission wholly relates to that portion of the proposed Metro Link beyond the station located at St Stephen's Green East. For the avoidance of any doubt we are fully supportive of the project from Estuary to St Stephen's Green, which we consider is long overdue.	TII notes and appreciates the observer's overall endorsement of the MetroLink Project with the exception of the section of the alignment south of the proposed St Stephen's Green Station. We have reviewed the observer's submission and responded to the observations made below.	
2	Submission	2	We submit that Bord Pleanala should defer the authorisation of the section of MetroLink beyond the St Stephen's Green station, other than to create a turning section similar in length to that which is currently proposed for Manders Terrace. Reasons as follows: 1 . Failure to consider an alternative routing of the terminus notably towards Rathmines. 2. Limitations of Charlemont terminus for radial extensions onwards to south city. 3. Potential Environmental benefits for south city consequential from pause for exploration of alternative extension route. 4. Poor access to Charlemont from Rathmines Road.	Please refer to responses (3) to (7) below.	
3	1. Failure to consider an alternative routing of the terminus towards Rathmines:	2	We would submit that the Rathmines or Portobello area would be a far more suitable location for a terminus but TII has wholly failed to consider this. This became relevant once the destination for a southern terminus was to be in or in the vicinity of the south inner city, rather than Sandyford.	<p>The reasons for proposing a station at Charlemont are explained below.</p> <p>The connection from St Stephens Green to Charlemont / Ranelagh is supported by the previous Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2016-2035) and the current Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2022-2042). The latter considers a range of options for the onward extension of MetroLink to meet the demand for travel over the period of the strategy. This includes consideration of the need for the upgrade of the Luas Green Line to the Metro with a Metro extension to Dublin south west, south or south east. Whilst the strategy envisages that further extensions will be delivered after 2042, a MetroLink which terminates at Charlemont allows for the possible extension of the Metro in all the above directions.</p> <p>The proximity of the Metro to the Luas line at Charlemont provides for a positive customer experience for all users with short interchange distance and due to the proximity, clear wayfinding and high visibility of the interchange. The interchange arrangements at Charlemont provide for significantly better interchange arrangements compared to an alternative interchange at St Stephen's Green Station. Passengers wishing to interchange between Luas and the Metro at an alternative St Stephen's Green terminus would face a 500m-walk along a route either through St Stephen's Green park or along the footpath north of the park, which adds significantly to the time for interchange and therefore the overall journey time for passengers and a less positive customer experience for all interchange users. This passenger experience would be reduced further for those with mobility or visual impairments as well as those travelling to/from the airport with luggage.</p> <p>The section of MetroLink route between St Stephen's Green and Charlemont Stations contributes significantly to the overall benefits of the scheme. It serves a significant area of the south city of Dublin and offers enhanced access from the local area to the city centre and a direct connection to Dublin Airport. It serves key trip attractors including residential areas and offices / workplace locations, with high passenger boarding and alighting figures in the peak hours. During the morning peak, at Charlemont Station the flows include 1,800 passengers alighting, 2,300 boarding and 1,229 passengers alighting, 2,276 boarding during the evening peak. The passenger numbers contribute significantly to the overall benefits of the scheme and the effect of these benefits outweigh the additional costs that are associated with the delivery and operation of the section from St Stephen's Green to Charlemont Station. Further information is available in Chapter 7: Consideration of the Alternatives, section 7.7.8 MetroLink Southern Terminus Location.</p>	

Submission No.			048		
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter			College and Wainsfort Residents Association		
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response	
314724: Estuary through Swords, Dublin Airport, Ballymun, Glasnevin and City Centre to Charlemont, Co. Dublin					
			(3) continued	<p>The location of the interchange at Charlemont does not preclude onward extension south. An interchange at Charlemont is supported by policy including the Dublin City Development Plan 2022 - 2028 and the Transport Strategy for the Greater Dublin Area. As noted by the GDA Transport Strategy 2022-2042, section 12.3.2, "Charlemont offers the optimal location for the primary interchange with the Green Line in response to growing demand in the longer term and is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the south west, south or south east of the city region should sufficient demand arise."</p> <p>By extending MetroLink to Charlemont it provides for future proofing of the Green Line, bypassing the capacity constrained Luas on-street running section, and ensures potential future connectivity options are enabled, either to the Green Line or for extensions of the Metro.</p> <p>The Charlemont Station interchange provides for increased passenger utilisation of the MetroLink system, thereby increasing the benefits delivered by the Project, reflected by an improved Project Benefit Cost Ration (BCR).</p> <p>TII would further note that the GDA Transport Strategy 2022-2042 (published in January 2023), section 12.3.8 Additional Luas Lines Post-2042, states that the analysis undertaken for the Transport Strategy indicates that a number of corridors in the GDA will, in the longer term, generate travel demand above that which can be catered for by higher capacity bus systems and are likely to require upgrading to light rail in the period after 2042. The planning and design work associated with this longer term framework can commence during the strategy period.</p> <p>Future Metro services to the south of Charlemont do not form part of the Metrolink scheme as presented under the Railway Order. TII's role is to deliver Metrolink as supported by the Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2022-2042) and Dublin City Development Plan 2022-2028. The connection from St Stephens Green to Charlemont / Ranelagh is supported by the current Transport Strategy. The Transport Strategies were prepared by the National Transport Authority, scrutinised by the Joint Oireachtas Committee on Transport, and approved by the Minister for Transport. It notes in section 12.3.2, "Charlemont offers the optimal location for the primary interchange with the Green Line in response to growing demand in the longer term and is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the southwest, south or southeast of the city region should sufficient demand arise "</p>	
4	1. Failure to consider an alternative routing of the terminus towards Rathmines:	2	<p>Rathmines Road under BusConnects will have four ‘A’ services and a number 80, 81 and 82 with an aggregate frequency of 33 per hour peak time in each direction. A terminus for MetroLink in Rathmines or Portobello would offer superb bus connectivity and would connect much of the south west city.</p> <p>We note that in the context of the preparation of the Greater Dublin Area Transport Plan 2022-2042, the National Transport Authority did a feasibility study entitled Metro to Knocklyon. We don't regard this as having been, in any way, adequate to fully assess the matter.</p> <p>We would request that a proper/comprehensive feasibility study be done to assess the options for the south west city.</p> <p>We do not believe that any progress can be made in assessing the alternative option unless a proper assessment of metro to the south west city is done.</p>	<p>The reasons for proposing a station at Charlemont are explained by response (3) above, including why a station is not preferred at Portobello, Rathmines or Harold's Cross.</p> <p>It is also of note that the proposed route alignment from Estuary to Charlemont is consistent and compliant with the GDA Transport Strategy 2022-2042 (published in January 2023) in which it states that the south city terminus at Charlemont offers the optimal location for interchange with the Luas Green Line in response to growing demand in the longer term and is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future Metro extensions to serve the south west, south or south east of the city region should sufficient demand arise.</p> <p>The NTA feasibility study referred to does not form part of this Railway Order Application.</p>	
5	2. Limitations of Charlemont terminus for radial extensions onwards to south city.	3	<p>It would seem, that the longer term intent is, that the MetroLink line be extended into the south city area. There are statements on this by various persons including NTA senior executives and the Minister. There are three alternatives posed:</p> <p>a. South west city towards Tallaght,</p> <p>b. Continuing on the existing Luas line or</p> <p>c. Heading south east towards UCD and Sandyford.</p> <p>We believe that if the tunnel is bored as far as Manders Terrace, this seriously compromises the ability for an extension to serve important communities.</p> <p>In particular we find it difficult to see how MetroLink could be extended to include relatively inner city suburbs such as Portobello, Lr. Rathmines, and Harold’s Cross.</p> <p>We would submit that proper planning requires a proper evaluation of the options for extension and that it is not consistent with proper planning to permit a station at Charlemont which would compromise the options.</p>	<p>Please refer to response (4) above.</p>	

Submission No.			048		
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter			College and Wainsfort Residents Association		
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response	
314724: Estuary through Swords, Dublin Airport, Ballymun, Glasnevin and City Centre to Charlemont, Co. Dublin					
6	3. Potential Environmental benefits for south city from pause for exploraation of alternative extension route.	3	<p>We believe that a metro extension would result in huge environmental benefits. In the area we live in which is not well served by buses the opportunity to have a metro close by would allow people to use a metro link passing close by would allow people to use a metro to get to the city and further northside without having to use their cars and in a timely manner.</p> <p>There is a push to take cars away from the centre but if the bus service is inadequate and we have seen many issues with ghost buses a metrolink would give people more guaranteed mode of transport and also much quicker than any bus service. The environmental impact of less cars on the road is what governments want to achieve.</p> <p>Our area will become a rat run for cars if the Templeogue Rd effectively become bus only.</p> <p>By extending MetroLink out towards Tallaght and outlying areas it would also mean less cars heading into our area for rat runs to get into Terenure .</p> <p>At certain times of the day there is gridlock in the Wainsfort area and this is before the proposed bus connects route which will make it even worse. The number of roads that cars can use to access Terenure will be reduced substantially and even with the new proposed bus corridors there won't be enough capacity to take all the extra passengers .</p> <p>If the powers that be want to be serious to reduce cars and therefore emissions then a Metro Link to the Southside to include Rathmines, Terenure, Templeogue, Knocklyon, Firhouse and parts of Tallaght has to be considered and a proper feasibility study should be undertaken before permission is granted to go past St Stephens Green.</p>	<p>As noted by the responses above and in accordance with the GDA Transport Strategy 2022-2042 (published in January 2023) a future Metro extension south is not precluded.</p> <p>The reasons for proposing a station at Charlemont are explained by response (3), including why the proposed line should be extended beyond St Stephen's Green.</p> <p>TII would also note (EIAR Chapter 3), MetroLink will divert 6.8 million car trips per annum in the early years, growing to 12 million per annum by 2045.</p> <p>As referred to in response (3) above, the future extentions to Metro services do not form part of this Railway Order Application.</p>	
7	4. Poor access to Charlemont from Rathmines Road.	4	<p>As we note above there will be numerous buses (33 per hour peak in each direction) on Rathmines Road once BusConnects is implemented. Therefore, we think it is very likely that a lot of passengers will alight at Portobello Bridge and walk across to the MetroLink, particularly if they want to access parts of the North city or the airport, quite likely with luggage.</p> <p>There is no thought given in the TII plans to the route such people will walk/take, but we suspect it would be on both sides of Canal Road and Grand Parade. The Railway Order plan contains no proposals for a proper infrastructure to facilitate this.</p> <p>However, the most obvious solution to this problem is to have a terminus closer to Rathmines Road.</p> <p>We submits that Bord Pleanala should defer the authorisation of the section of MetroLink beyond the St Stephen's Green station, other than to create a turning section similar in length to that which is currently proposed for Manders Terrace.</p> <p>It would be premature to constrain the available options by allowing MetroLink to proceed beyond St Stephens Green to Charlemont / Manders Terrace.</p> <p>“What had the outside reviewers have to say about continuing to Charlemont/Manders Terrace?”</p> <p>Jaspers: "The connection to Ranelagh could feasibly be deferred until there is clarity on the future of the Green Line (subject to an improved understanding of how this could physically be delivered in a scenario with Metro operational)"</p>	<p>The scope of the MetroLink project does not include the improvement or modification of the wider transport network.</p> <p>The above responses explain why TII does not consider it is correct or appropriate that the MetroLink alignment south of St Stephen's Green should be omitted, and also demonstrates why the proposed Charlemont Station has been selected by TII as the preferred interchange with the Luas Green Line.</p> <p>A scheme which terminates at St Stephen's Green would not be consistent with the Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2022-2042). In addition any decision to terminate the scheme at St Stephen's Green will significantly impact on the overall viability and benefits of scheme.</p>	